

REMARKS

Claims 1-32 are pending. Claims 1, 8, 10, 12, 17, 19, 21, 26, 28 and 31 have been amended and claims 2, 11 and 20 have been canceled.

Allowable Subject Matter

The Office has indicated that claims 3-9, 12-18, 21-27 and 29-32 would be allowable if rewritten in independent form including all of the limitations of the base claim and any intervening claims. Accordingly, the Applicants have amended claims 3, 8, 12, 17, 21, 26, 29 and 31 so that they are in independent form, including all of the limitations of their base claims and any intervening claims. Accordingly, these claims should now be allowable. And because claims 4-7, 9, 13-16, 18, 22-25, 27, 30 and 32 depend from one of these now independent claims, they also should be allowable.

Claim Rejections under 35 U.S.C. §112

The Office has rejected claims 28-32 under 35 U.S.C. § 112, second paragraph as being indefinite. Specifically, the Office asserts that in line 3 of claim 28 the recitation “said computer readable instructions” has “no antecedent basis since Applicant has not defined any means of computer-readable instructions.” The Applicants have amended claim 28 to provide proper antecedent basis. No new matter has been introduced as a result of this amendment. As such, all elements of claim 28 now have proper antecedent basis and claim 28 and all claims that depend from claim 28 should satisfy the requirements of Section 112.

Claim Rejections under 35 U.S.C. §103

Claims 1-2, 10-11, 19-20 and 28 stand rejected under 35 U.S.C. §103(a) as being unpatentable over SLOAN et al. (PRT for Realtime Rendering in Dynamic, Low frequency lighting Environments) in view of Baum et al.

Claims 1, 10 and 19 have been amended to incorporate the features of claims 2, 11, and 20, respectively. In addition, claims 1, 10, 19 and 28 have been amended to further recite “sampling a PRT vector at each vertex.” The applicants respectfully submit that neither SLOAN nor Baum teaches or suggests this feature, alone or in combination. The Applicants

DOCKET NO.: MSFT-2901/306874.01
Application No.: 10/815,141
Office Action Dated: 07/03/2007

PATENT

note that this feature, albeit in combination with others, is recited in the now allowed claims. The Applicants respectfully submit that this feature alone is sufficient to distinguish over SLOAN and Baum. Accordingly, reconsideration of the Section 103 rejection of amended claims 1, 10, 19 and 28 is respectfully requested.

CONCLUSION

For all the foregoing reasons, the Applicants respectfully submit that the present application is now in condition for allowance.

Date: September 28, 2007

/Steven B. Samuels/
Steven B. Samuels
Registration No. 37,711

Woodcock Washburn LLP
Cira Centre
2929 Arch Street, 12th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19104-2891
Telephone: (215) 568-3100
Facsimile: (215) 568-3439